

WEST SEGMENT

RANKING LEGEND

MP = Most Preferred
P = Preferred

IP = Intermediate Preferred
LP = Least Preferred

1 - Protect and enhance terrestrial and aquatic natural features and linkages											
Criteria	Indicators*	Do Nothing (Existing Conditions)	Alternative 1 (Headland-Beach)	Alternative 2A (Short Span Bridge)	Alternative 2B (Long Span Bridge)	Alternative 3A (Short Span Island-Bridge)	Alternative 3B (Long Span Island-Bridge)	Alternative 4 (Causeway)	Alternative 5A (Narrow Beach + Bridge)	Alternative 5B (Wide Beach)	
Extent of aquatic habitat enhanced or diminished	- Increase physical morphology and substrate diversity - Additional habitat enhancement opportunities - Potential for habitat loss	IP No lake-filling and no opportunities to enhance habitat	MP Significant opportunities to enhance habitat, though the amount of lakefill is high	P Small but high quality habitat enhancements and little to no lakefill	IP Small but high quality habitat enhancements and little to no lakefill	LP Habitat inside the basin inappropriate for open coast conditions.	IP Medium amount of lakefill and medium amount of habitat enhancements.	LP Habitat inside the basin inappropriate for open coast conditions.	MP High quality and amount of habitat enhancements, though high amount of lakefill.	MP High quality and amount of habitat enhancements, though high amount of lakefill.	
Potential for impact on aquatic Species at Risk and other species of conservation concern	- Atlantic Salmon - American Eel - Round Whitefish - Lake Trout	IP No impacts, negative or positive	MP High amount of benefits	P Some benefits	IP Small amount of benefits	LP Habitat inside the basin inappropriate for open coast conditions.	IP Small amount of benefits	LP Habitat inside the basin inappropriate for open coast conditions.	MP High amount of benefits	MP High amount of benefits	
Extent of terrestrial habitat attributes enhanced or diminished	- Create or improve habitat - Increase connectivity - Impact to vegetation communities of concern	IP No change in baseline conditions.	P Second-highest enhancement extent	IP Low amount of enhancements.	IP Low amount of enhancements.	LP Does not provide habitat that is appropriate for open coast.	IP Some enhancements, but also potential to diminish.	LP Does not provide habitat that is appropriate for open coast.	MP Largest amount of enhancements	MP Largest amount of enhancements	
Potential for impact on Areas of Natural or Scientific Interest and Environmentally Sensitive Areas	- Scarborough Bluffs Earth Science ANSI - Scarborough Bluffs Life Science ANSI - Scarborough Bluffs Sequence ESA	IP Largest negative impacts: highest loss of tablelands	P Positive impact: tablelands preserved	IP Largest negative impacts: highest loss of tablelands	IP Largest negative impacts: highest loss of tablelands	P Positive impact: tablelands preserved	IP Loss of tableland reduced, but not minimized	P Positive impact: tablelands preserved	P Positive impact: tablelands preserved	P Positive impact: tablelands preserved	
Potential for impact on terrestrial Species at Risk	- Bank Swallow - Barn Swallow - Wood Thrush	P No change to baseline conditions	IP Potential for impacts to the amount of Bank Swallow nesting habitat, benefits to Barn Swallow and Wood Thrush.	MP No change to baseline conditions. Potential for benefits to Barn Swallow.	MP No change to baseline conditions. Potential for benefits to Barn Swallow.	IP Potential for impacts to the amount of Bank Swallow nesting habitat, benefits to Barn Swallow and Wood Thrush.	IP Potential for impacts to the amount of Bank Swallow nesting habitat, benefits to Barn Swallow and Wood Thrush.	IP Potential for impacts to the amount of Bank Swallow nesting habitat, benefits to Wood Thrush.	IP Potential for impacts to the amount of Bank Swallow nesting habitat, benefits to Barn Swallow and Wood Thrush.	IP Potential for impacts to the amount of Bank Swallow nesting habitat, benefits to Wood Thrush.	
		Intermediate Preferred	Most Preferred	Preferred	Intermediate Preferred	Least Preferred	Intermediate Preferred	Least Preferred	Most Preferred	Most Preferred	

2 - Manage Public Safety and Property Risk

Criteria	Indicators*	Do Nothing (Existing Conditions)	Alternative 1 (Headland-Beach)	Alternative 2A (Short Span Bridge)	Alternative 2B (Long Span Bridge)	Alternative 3A (Short Span Island-Bridge)	Alternative 3B (Long Span Island-Bridge)	Alternative 4 (Causeway)	Alternative 5A (Narrow Beach + Bridge)	Alternative 5B (Wide Beach)
Ability to minimize public safety risk and property loss as a result of slope erosion/failure	- Safe shoreline access and slope failure - Public property loss and erosion	LP Risk remains	MP All risks minimized	P Risk to open space remains	P Risk to open space remains	P Risk to open space remains	P Risk to open space remains	MP All risks minimized	MP All risks minimized	MP All risks minimized
Ability to minimize public safety risk as a result of coastal processes	- Shoreline structures integrity - Safe access and coastal conditions	IP Existing access risk remains	P Access risk minimized. Small risk to structures.	IP Some access risk remains. Risk to structures minimal.	IP Some public access risk remains. Risk to structures minimal.	IP Some public access risk remains. Medium increase to risk to structures.	IP Some public access risk remains. Risk to structures minimal.	IP Some public access risk remains. Medium increase to risk to structures.	IP Some public access risk remains. Medium increase to risk to structures.	P Access risk minimized. Small risk to structures.
Improve Emergency Services access to the waterfront.	- Emergency services access	LP No access	MP Best access	IP Small increase in access	IP Small increase in access	IP Small increase in access	IP Small increase in access	MP Best access	IP Small increase in access	P Second-best access
Ability to protect source water protection areas	- Impact to source water	P No impacts	P No impacts	P No impacts	P No impacts	P No impacts	P No impacts	P No impacts	P No impacts	P No impacts
		Least Preferred	Most Preferred	Intermediate Preferred	Intermediate Preferred	Intermediate Preferred	Intermediate Preferred	Most Preferred	Preferred	Most Preferred

3 - Provide an Enjoyable Waterfront Experience

Criteria	Indicators*	Do Nothing (Existing Conditions)	Alternative 1 (Headland-Beach)	Alternative 2A (Short Span Bridge)	Alternative 2B (Long Span Bridge)	Alternative 3A (Short Span Island-Bridge)	Alternative 3B (Long Span Island-Bridge)	Alternative 4 (Causeway)	Alternative 5A (Narrow Beach + Bridge)	Alternative 5B (Wide Beach)
Improve Public Access to the Waterfront	- Continuous public access - Accommodate a primary multi-use trail - Meet AODA grade standard - Direct access to water	LP No improvement	MP Most improvement	IP Some improvement	IP Some improvement	P Moderate improvement	P Moderate improvement	IP Some improvement	P Moderate improvement	MP Most improvement
Ability to minimize change to existing bluff character	- Impacts to character of the Cathedral Bluffs, Needles Formation and East Point Park Bluffs.	MP No change to baseline conditions	LP Accelerates bluff character change	MP No change to baseline conditions	MP No change to baseline conditions	IP Somewhat accelerates bluff character change	IP Somewhat accelerates bluff character change	LP Accelerates bluff character change	LP Accelerates bluff character change	LP Accelerates bluff character change
Potential for changes to the use of the waterfront for recreation	- Character of sand beaches - Impact to Bluffer's Park Blue Flag beach - Impact to navigation	P No changes, baseline conditions maintained	IP Negative changes to sand beach character	IP Minor negative changes to sand beach character	IP Minor negative changes to sand beach character	IP Minor negative changes to sand beach character	IP Minor negative changes to sand beach character	LP Potential for beach water quality impacts.	MP Positive changes (beach capacity increase, navigation improvement)	MP Positive changes (beach capacity increase, navigation improvement)
		Least Preferred	Preferred	Intermediate Preferred	Intermediate Preferred	Intermediate Preferred	Intermediate Preferred	Least Preferred	Preferred	Most Preferred

4 - Consistency and coordination with other initiatives

Criteria	Indicators*	Do Nothing (Existing Conditions)	Alternative 1 (Headland-Beach)	Alternative 2A (Short Span Bridge)	Alternative 2B (Long Span Bridge)	Alternative 3A (Short Span Island-Bridge)	Alternative 3B (Long Span Island-Bridge)	Alternative 4 (Causeway)	Alternative 5A (Narrow Beach + Bridge)	Alternative 5B (Wide Beach)
Ability to integrate with City and other agency plans and initiatives	- WWFMMP objectives - Metrolinx rail track expansion - Guild Park and Gardens Management Plan - MNR Fish Community Objectives for Lake Ontario	LP No ability to integrate with the City and other agencies plans and initiatives	MP Highest ability to integrate	P Integrates with most, but not all applicable plans and initiatives	IP Integrates with few applicable plans and initiatives	LP No ability to integrate with the City and other agencies plans and initiatives	IP Integrates with few applicable plans and initiatives	LP No ability to integrate with the City and other agencies plans and initiatives	MP Highest ability to integrate	MP Highest ability to integrate
Compatibility with existing land uses.	- Residential - Industrial	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A
Potential impact on archaeological resources, built heritage resources, and cultural heritage landscapes	- Archaeological sites, known or potential	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A
		Least Preferred	Most Preferred	Preferred	Intermediate Preferred	Least Preferred	Intermediate Preferred	Least Preferred	Most Preferred	Most Preferred

5 - Achieve value for cost

Criteria	Indicators*	Do Nothing (Existing Conditions)	Alternative 1 (Headland-Beach)	Alternative 2A (Short Span Bridge)	Alternative 2B (Long Span Bridge)	Alternative 3A (Short Span Island-Bridge)	Alternative 3B (Long Span Island-Bridge)	Alternative 4 (Causeway)	Alternative 5A (Narrow Beach + Bridge)	Alternative 5B (Wide Beach)
Estimated capital cost	- Construction cost, relative - Property acquisition cost, relative	MP No capital cost	P Low capital cost	P Low capital cost	LP Highest capital cost	P Low capital cost	IP Intermediate capital cost	P Low capital cost	LP Highest capital cost	LP Highest capital cost
Maintenance and operations costs	- Maintenance and operations cost, relative	MP No maintenance cost	P Low operations and maintenance cost	LP Highest operations and maintenance cost	LP Highest operations and maintenance cost	IP Intermediate operations and maintenance cost	IP Intermediate operations and maintenance cost	P Low operations and maintenance cost	IP Intermediate operations and maintenance cost	P Low operations and maintenance cost
		Most Preferred	Preferred	Intermediate Preferred	Least Preferred	Preferred	Intermediate Preferred	Preferred	Least Preferred	Intermediate Preferred
FINAL / OVERALL RANKING		Intermediate Preferred	Most Preferred: Meets most objectives best.	Intermediate Preferred	Intermediate Preferred	Least Preferred	Intermediate Preferred	Least Preferred	Preferred	Most Preferred: Meets most objectives best. Carried forward as part of the Integrated Alternative due to its ability to expand existing

CENTRAL SEGMENT

Scarborough Waterfront Project
PRELIMINARY Alternatives Evaluation
Central Segment (DRAFT)

RANKING LEGEND

MP = Most Preferred
P = Preferred

IP = Intermediate Preferred
LP = Least Preferred

1 - Protect and enhance terrestrial and aquatic natural features and linkages

Criteria	Indicators*		Do Nothing (Existing Conditions)		Alternative 1 (Headland-Beach)		Alternative 2 (Revetment)
Extent of aquatic habitat enhanced or diminished	- Increase physical morphology and substrate diversity - Additional habitat enhancement opportunities - Potential for habitat loss	IP	No lake-filling and no opportunities to enhance habitat	P	Most opportunities to enhance habitat, though the amount of infill is high	IP	Intermediate amount of enhancement opportunities
Potential for impact on aquatic Species at Risk and other species of conservation concern	- Atlantic Salmon - American Eel - Round Whitefish - Lake Trout	IP	No negative or positive impacts as no change to existing conditions	MP	High amount of benefits	P	Intermediate amount of benefits
Extent of terrestrial habitat attributes enhanced or diminished	- Create or improve habitat - Increase connectivity - Impact to vegetation communities of concern	LP	No change in baseline conditions	MP	Highest extent of enhancements	IP	Extent of enhancements small
Potential for impact on Areas of Natural or Scientific Interest and Environmentally Sensitive Areas	- Bellamy Ravine/Sylvan Park ESA - Guild Woods ESA - Scarborough Bluffs Earth Science ANSI	P	No change in baseline conditions	MP	Potential for positive impacts	MP	Potential for positive impacts
Potential for impact on terrestrial Species at Risk	- Bank Swallow - Barn Swallow - Wood Thrush	P	No change in baseline conditions	MP	Potential for positive impacts	P	Small potential for positive impacts
			Intermediate		Most Preferred		Preferred

2 - Manage public safety and property risk

Criteria	Indicators*		Do Nothing (Existing Conditions)		Alternative 1 (Headland-Beach)		Alternative 2 (Revetment)
Ability to minimize public safety risk and property loss as a result of slope erosion/failure	- Safe shoreline access and slope failure - Public property loss and erosion	LP	Existing risk remains	MP	Risk minimized	MP	Risk minimized
Ability to minimize public safety risk as a result of coastal processes	- Shoreline structures integrity - Safe access and coastal conditions	LP	Existing risk remains	MP	Risk minimized	P	Risk partly minimized
Improve Emergency Services access to the waterfront.	- Emergency services access	IP	Some access improvement	MP	Most access improvement	MP	Most access improvement
Ability to protect source water protection areas	- Impact to source water	P	No change in baseline conditions	P	No impacts	P	No impacts
			Least Preferred		Most Preferred		Preferred

3 - Provide an enjoyable waterfront experience

Criteria	Indicators*		Do Nothing (Existing Conditions)		Alternative 1 (Headland-Beach)		Alternative 2 (Revetment)
Improve Public Access to the Waterfront	- Continuous public access - Accommodate a primary multi-use trail - Meet AODA grade standard - Direct access to water	LP	No public access improvements	MP	Most access improvement	P	Second-most access improvement
Ability to minimize change to existing bluff character	- Impacts to character of the Cathedral Bluffs, Needles Formation, and East Point Park Bluffs.	MP	No change in baseline conditions	MP	No change in baseline conditions	MP	No change in baseline conditions
Potential for changes to the use of the waterfront for recreation	- Character of sand beaches - Impact to Bluffer's Park Blue Flag beach - Impact to navigation	MP	No changes	MP	No changes	MP	No changes
			Least Preferred		Most Preferred		Preferred

4 - Consistency and coordination with other initiatives

Criteria	Indicators*		Do Nothing (Existing Conditions)		Alternative 1 (Headland-Beach)		Alternative 2 (Revetment)
Ability to integrate with City and other agency plans and initiatives	- WWFMMP objectives - Metrolinx rail track expansion - Guild Park & Gardens Mgmt. Plan - MNRF Fish Comm. Objectives for Lake Ontario	LP	No ability to integrate	MP	Most integration	P	Second-most integration
Compatibility with existing land uses.	- Residential - Industrial	LP	Least compatibility	MP	Most compatibility	MP	Most compatibility
Potential impact on archaeological resources, built heritage resources, and cultural heritage landscapes	- Archaeological sites, known or potential	MP	No potential for impacts	P	Potential for impacts, mitigation possible	P	Potential for impacts, mitigation possible
			Least Preferred		Most Preferred		Preferred

5 - Achieve value for cost

Criteria	Indicators*		Do Nothing (Existing Conditions)		Alternative 1 (Headland-Beach)		Alternative 2 (Revetment)
Estimated capital cost	- Construction cost, relative - Property acquisition cost, relative	MP	No cost	LP	Highest cost	P	Intermediate cost
Maintenance and operations costs	- Maintenance and operations cost, relative	IP	Least cost	P	Low cost	MP	Lowest cost
			Most Preferred		Intermediate Preferred		Preferred

FINAL/OVERALL RANKING	Intermediate Preferred		Most Preferred Meets most objectives best		Preferred
------------------------------	-------------------------------	--	---	--	------------------

EAST SEGMENT

Scarborough Waterfront Project
PRELIMINARY Alternatives Evaluation
East Segment (DRAFT)

RANKING LEGEND

MP = Most Preferred
P = Preferred

IP = Intermediate Preferred
LP = Least Preferred

1. Protect and enhance terrestrial and aquatic natural features and linkages													
Criteria	Indicators*		Do Nothing (Existing Conditions)	Alternative 1A (Headland-Beach with top of bluffs connection)	Alternative 1B (Headland-Beach with base of bluffs connection)	Alternative 2A (Bridge & Headlands with top of bluffs connection)	Alternative 2B (Bridge & Headlands with base of bluffs connection)	Alternative 3A (Island-Bridge & Headlands with top of bluffs connection)	Alternative 3B (Island-Bridge & Headlands with base of bluffs connection)	Alternative 4A (Headland-Beach with Revetment to East Point Park)	Alternative 4B (Headland-Beach to East Point Park)	Alternative 5 (Top of bluffs connection over Grey Abbey Ravine)	
Extent of aquatic habitat enhanced or diminished	- Increase physical morphology and substrate diversity - Additional habitat enhancement opportunities - Potential for habitat loss	IP	No enhancements and no negative impacts	P Second-highest enhancement potential	LP Potential for diminished habitat quality	P Second-highest enhancement potential	LP Potential for diminished habitat quality	P Second-highest enhancement potential	LP Potential for diminished habitat quality	P Second-highest enhancement potential	MP Highest potential for enhanced habitat quality	IP No enhancements and no negative impacts	
Potential for impact on aquatic Species at Risk and other species of conservation concern	- Atlantic Salmon - American Eel - Round Whitefish - Lake Trout	IP	No negative or positive impacts as no change to existing conditions	P Second-highest potential for benefits	MP Highest potential for benefits	P Second-highest potential for benefits	MP Highest potential for benefits	P Second-highest potential for benefits	MP Highest potential for benefits	MP Highest potential for benefits	MP Highest potential for benefits	IP No negative or positive impacts as no change to existing conditions	
Extent of terrestrial habitat attributes enhanced or diminished	- Create or improve habitat - Increase connectivity - Impact to vegetation communities of concern	IP	No change in baseline conditions	P Potential for overall enhancement	P Potential for overall enhancement	P Potential for overall enhancement	P Potential for overall enhancement	P Potential for overall enhancement	P Potential for overall enhancement	P Potential for overall enhancement	P Potential for overall enhancement	P Potential for overall enhancement	
Potential for impact on Areas of Natural or Scientific Interest and Environmentally Sensitive Areas	- East Point Bluffs Sequence Life Science ANSI - East Point ESA	LP	Highest potential for negative impact (highest loss of land)	IP Second-highest potential for negative impact (loss of land)	MP Positive impact (land loss prevented)	IP Second-highest potential for negative impact (loss of land)	MP Positive impact (land loss prevented)	IP Second-highest potential for negative impact (loss of land)	MP Positive impact (land loss prevented)	P Bluffs stabilization triggered at Greyabbey park, EPP portion of ANSI and ESA remains unprotected & tableland loss continues.	P Bluffs stabilization triggered/stimulated at Greyabbey park, EPP portion of ANSI and ESA remains unprotected and tableland loss continues.	LP Highest potential for negative impact (highest loss of land)	
Potential for impact on terrestrial Species at Risk	- Bank Swallow	MP	No impacts	P Potential for impacts to small amount of Bank Swallow nesting habitat	LP Potential for impacts to largest amount of Bank Swallow nesting habitat	P Potential for impacts to small amount of Bank Swallow nesting habitat	LP Potential for impacts to largest amount of Bank Swallow nesting habitat	P Potential for impacts to small amount of Bank Swallow nesting habitat	LP Potential for impacts to largest amount of Bank Swallow nesting habitat	IP Potential for impacts to larger amount of Bank Swallow nesting habitat	IP Potential for impacts to larger amount of Bank Swallow nesting habitat	MP No impacts	
			Intermediate Preferred	Intermediate Preferred	Intermediate Preferred	Intermediate Preferred	Intermediate Preferred	Intermediate Preferred	Intermediate Preferred	Preferred	Most Preferred	Intermediate Preferred	

2. Manage Public Safety and Property Risk

Criteria	Indicators*		Do Nothing (Existing Conditions)		Alternative 1A (Headland-Beach with top of bluffs connection)		Alternative 1B (Headland-Beach with base of bluffs connection)		Alternative 2A (Bridge & Headlands with top of bluffs connection)		Alternative 2B (Bridge & Headlands with base of bluffs connection)		Alternative 3A (Island-Bridge & Headlands with top of bluffs connection)		Alternative 3B (Island-Bridge & Headlands with base of bluffs connection)		Alternative 4A (Headland-Beach with Revetment to East Point Park)		Alternative 4B (Headland-Beach to East Point Park)		Alternative 5 (Top of bluffs connection over Grey Abbey Ravine)		
Ability to minimize public safety risk and property loss as a result of slope erosion/failure	- Safe shoreline access and slope failure - Public property loss and erosion	LP	Existing risk remains	P	Long-term risk to property remains	MP	Risk minimized	P	Long-term risk to property remains	MP	Risk minimized	P	Long-term risk to property remains	MP	Risk minimized	MP	Risk minimized	MP	Risk minimized	MP	Risk minimized	LP	Existing risk remains
Ability to minimize public safety risk as a result of coastal processes	- Shoreline structures integrity - Safe access and coastal conditions	IP	Existing risk to public access remains	IP	Minimal reduction in existing risk to public access	IP	Public safety risk minimized, risk to structures integrity introduced.	IP	Minimal reduction in existing risk to public access	IP	Public safety risk minimized, risk to structures integrity introduced.	IP	Minimal reduction in existing risk to public access	IP	Public safety risk minimized, risk to structures integrity introduced.	IP	Public safety risk mostly minimized, risk to structures integrity introduced.	IP	Public safety risk mostly minimized, risk to structures integrity introduced.	IP	Public safety risk mostly minimized, risk to structures integrity introduced.	IP	Existing risk to public access remains
Improve Emergency Services access to the waterfront.	- Emergency services access	LP	Allows for only limited access for some vehicles.	MP	Provides access along entire length of Segment.	MP	Provides access along entire length of Segment.	P	Allows for only limited access for some vehicles (no access along the bridge structure)	MP	Provides access along entire length of Segment.	P	Allows for only limited access for some vehicles.	MP	Provides access along entire length of Segment.	MP	Provides access along entire length of Segment.	MP	Provides access along entire length of Segment.	MP	Provides access along entire length of Segment.	MP	Allows for only limited access for some vehicles. No access to water's edge.
Ability to protect source water protection areas	- Impact to source water	P	No impact as no change in existing conditions	P	No impacts	P	No impacts	P	No impacts	P	No impacts	P	No impacts	P	No impacts	P	No impacts	P	No impacts	P	No impacts	P	No impacts
			Least Preferred		Preferred		Most Preferred		Preferred		Most Preferred		Preferred		Most Preferred		Most Preferred		Most Preferred		Most Preferred		Intermediate Preferred

3. Provide an Enjoyable Waterfront Experience

Criteria	Indicators*		Do Nothing (Existing Conditions)	Alternative 1A (Headland- Beach with top of bluffs connection)	Alternative 1B (Headland-Beach with base of bluffs connection)	Alternative 2A (Bridge & Headlands with top of bluffs connection)	Alternative 2B (Bridge & Headlands with base of bluffs connection)	Alternative 3A (Island-Bridge & Headlands with top of bluffs connection)	Alternative 3B (Island-Bridge & Headlands with base of bluffs connection)	Alternative 4A (Headland-Beach with Revetment to East Point Park)	Alternative 4B (Headland-Beach to East Point Park)	Alternative 5 (Top of bluffs connection over Grey Abbey Ravine)
Improve Public Access to the Waterfront	- Continuous public access - Accommodate a primary multi-use trail - Meet AODA grade standard - Direct access to water	LP	No improvement	IP Some improvement	MP Most improvement	IP Some improvement	P Intermediate improvement	IP Some improvement	P Intermediate improvement	MP Most improvement	MP Most improvement	P Intermediate improvement
Ability to minimize change to existing bluff character	- Impacts to character of the Cathedral Bluffs, Needles Formation, and East Point Park Bluffs.	MP	No change to baseline conditions	P Accelerates bluff character change in smallest area	LP Accelerates bluff character change in largest area	P Accelerates bluff character change in smallest area	LP Accelerates bluff character change in largest area	P Accelerates bluff character change in smallest area	LP Accelerates bluff character change in largest area	IP Accelerates bluff character change in second-largest area	IP Accelerates bluff character change in second-largest area	MP No change to baseline conditions
Potential for changes to the use of the waterfront for recreation	- Character of sand beaches - Impact to Bluffer's Park Blue Flag beach - Impact to navigation	P	No change to baseline conditions	IP Small section of existing sand beach undergoes a negative change in character	LP Largest section of existing sand beach undergoes a negative change in character	IP Small section of existing sand beach undergoes a negative change in character	LP Largest section of existing sand beach undergoes a negative change in character	IP Small section of existing sand beach undergoes a negative change in character	LP Largest section of existing sand beach undergoes a negative change in character	P Second-largest section of existing sand beach altered, medium benefits to navigation.	P Second-largest section of existing sand beach altered, medium benefits to navigation.	P No change to baseline conditions
			Intermediate Preferred	Intermediate Preferred	Intermediate Preferred	Intermediate Preferred	Intermediate Preferred	Intermediate Preferred	Intermediate Preferred	Preferred	Preferred	Preferred



4. Consistency and coordination with other initiatives

Criteria	Indicators*		Do Nothing (Existing Conditions)		Alternative 1A (Headland-Beach with top of bluffs connection)		Alternative 1B (Headland-Beach with base of bluffs connection)		Alternative 2A (Bridge & Headlands with top of bluffs connection)		Alternative 2B (Bridge & Headlands with base of bluffs connection)		Alternative 3A (Island-Bridge & Headlands with top of bluffs connection)		Alternative 3B (Island-Bridge & Headlands with base of bluffs connection)		Alternative 4A (Headland-Beach with Revetment to East Point Park)		Alternative 4B (Headland-Beach to East Point Park)		Alternative 5 (Top of bluffs connection over Grey Abbey Ravine)
Ability to integrate with City and other agency plans and initiatives	- WWFMMP objectives - Metrolinx rail track expansion - Guild Park and Gardens Mgmt. Plan - MNRF Fish Community Objectives for Lake Ontario	LP	No ability to integrate	P	Integrates with all, to some extent	P	Integrates with all, to some extent	P	Integrates with all, to some extent	P	Integrates with all, to some extent	P	Integrates with all, to some extent	P	Integrates with all, to some extent	P	Integrates with all, to some extent	MP	Highest ability to integrate with all	IP	Integrates with few
Compatibility with existing land uses.	- Residential - Industrial	LP	Least compatibility	LP	Least compatibility	MP	Most compatibility	LP	Least compatibility	MP	Most compatibility	LP	Least compatibility	MP	Most compatibility	MP	Most compatibility	MP	Most compatibility	LP	Least compatibility
Potential impact on archaeological resources, built heritage resources, and cultural heritage landscapes	- Archaeological sites, known or potential	MP	No impact	MP	No impact	P	Potential for impact, mitigation possible	MP	No impact	P	Potential for impact, mitigation possible	MP	No impact	P	Potential for impact, mitigation possible	MP	No impact	MP	No impact	P	Potential for impact, mitigation possible
			Least Preferred		Least Preferred		Preferred		Least Preferred		Preferred		Least Preferred		Preferred		Preferred		Most Preferred		Least Preferred

DRAFT

5. Achieve value for cost

Criteria	Indicators*		Do Nothing (Existing Conditions)		Alternative 1A (Headland-Beach with top of bluffs connection)		Alternative 1B (Headland-Beach with base of bluffs connection)		Alternative 2A (Bridge & Headlands with top of bluffs connection)		Alternative 2B (Bridge & Headlands with base of bluffs connection)		Alternative 3A (Island-Bridge & Headlands with top of bluffs connection)		Alternative 3B (Island-Bridge & Headlands with base of bluffs connection)		Alternative 4A (Headland-Beach with Revetment to East Point Park)		Alternative 4B (Headland-Beach to East Point Park)		Alternative 5 (Top of bluffs connection over Grey Abbey Ravine)
Estimated capital cost	- Construction cost, relative - Property acquisition cost, relative	MP	No cost	P	Second-lowest cost	LP	Highest cost	P	Second-lowest cost	IP	Second-highest cost	IP	Second-highest cost	LP	Highest cost	P	Second-lowest cost	IP	Second-highest cost	MP	Lowest cost
Maintenance and operations costs	- Maintenance and operations cost, relative	MP	Lowest operations and maintenance cost	P	Low operations and maintenance cost	P	Low operations and maintenance cost	IP	Second-highest operations and maintenance cost	LP	Highest operations and maintenance cost	LP	Highest operations and maintenance cost	LP	Highest operations and maintenance cost	P	Low operations and maintenance cost	P	Low operations and maintenance cost	P	Low operations and maintenance cost
			Most Preferred		Preferred		Least Preferred		Intermediate Preferred		Intermediate Preferred		Intermediate Preferred		Least Preferred		Preferred		Intermediate Preferred		Preferred
			Intermediate Preferred		Intermediate Preferred		Intermediate Preferred		Intermediate Preferred		Intermediate Preferred		Intermediate Preferred		Intermediate Preferred		Preferred		Most Preferred Meets most objectives best		Intermediate Preferred

DRAFT